Exhibit D

Case 1:20-cv-00052-SPW Document 320-4 Filed 02/06/24 Page 2 of 25
Case 2:02-cv-00190-EFS ECF No. 7 filed 08/05/02 PageID.32 Page 1 of 24

1 2	Gregory J. Arpin, WSBA #2746 Donald G. Stone, WSBA #7547 PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN,	The Honorable Wm. Fremming Nielsen
3	BROOKE & MILLER LLP	
4	717 W. Sprague Avenue, Suite 1200	FILED IN THE U.S. DISTRICT COURT
5	Spokane, Washington 99201-3505	EASTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
6	Telephone: (509) 455-6000	AUG 05 2002
	Facsimile: (509) 838-0007	JAMES R. LARSEN, CLERK
7		SPOKANE, WASHINGTON
8	Attorneys for Defendants Watchtower	
ا و	and Othello North Spanish Congrega	ition
10	UNITED STATES DIST	TRICT COURT FOR THE
11		CT OF WASHINGTON
12		
13	ERICA RODRIGUEZ, a single)
	person,) EFS
14	Disintiff) No. CS-02-0190-WEN
15	Plaintiff,)) DEFENDANTS
16	vs.) WATCHTOWER AND
17		OTHELLO (NORTH)
18	WATCHTOWER BIBLE and) SPANISH
	TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK,) CONGREGATION'S
19	INC., a New York corporation;) ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S
20	OTHELLO SPANISH) COMPLAINT
21	CONGREGATION OF)
22	JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, an unknown legal entity; and MANUEL) And
23	BELIZ, individually and on behalf of) JOINDER IN DEMAND FOR
24	his marital community,) JURY TRIAL
	,)
25	Defendants.	_)
26		
27		
28		PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN, BROOKE & MILLER LLF
29	DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S	717 WEST SPRAGUE AVENUE, SUITE 1200 SPOKANE, WA 99201 PHONE: (509) 455-6000
30	COMPLAINT - 1	51 ORANE, WA 79201 FITONE. (309) 433-0000

The defendants, WATCHTOWER BIBLE and TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC., (hereinafter "Watchtower") and OTHELLO SPANISH CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES (hereinafter "Othello North Spanish Congregation"), by and through their attorneys, Paine, Hamblen, Coffin, Brooke & Miller LLP, Gregory J. Arpin and Donald G. Stone, for answer to plaintiff's complaint, admit, deny, and allege as follows:

I.

JURISDICTION

Admit that the amount in controversy exceeds \$75,000 and that diversity of citizenship exists between the plaintiff and the defendants. Further admit that this Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the plaintiff's complaint under the authority cited in paragraph I of plaintiff's complaint. Defendants deny any remaining allegations of paragraph I of plaintiff's complaint.

II.

PARTIES

1. With reference to paragraph 1 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that plaintiff Erica Rodriguez previously resided in the State of Washington; admit

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 2

PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN, BROOKE & MILLER LLP 117 WEST SPRAGUE AVENUE, SUITE 1200 SPOKANE, WA 99201 PHONE: (509) 455-6000

14 15

13

17

16

19 20

18

21 22

23 24

25 26

27

28

29 30 that she currently resides in Sacramento, California; admit that she is presently of the age of majority; and further admit that plaintiff and her parents previously attended services of the Othello North Spanish Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses in Othello, Washington. Defendants deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 1 of plaintiff's complaint.

- 2. With reference to paragraph 2 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that defendant Othello Spanish Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, more properly known as Othello North Spanish Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses located in Othello, Washington, is an unincorporated association and a part of the worldwide religious organization known as Jehovah's Witnesses, but deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 2 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 3. With reference to paragraph 3 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that at one time, plaintiff and her parents were publishers and previously associated with the Othello North Spanish Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, but deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 3 of plaintiff's complaint.
 - 4. Deny paragraph 4 of plaintiff's complaint.

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and

COMPLAINT - 3

28

29

30

5. With reference to paragraph 5 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that the Governing Body exercises spiritual oversight of the organization of Jehovah's Witnesses worldwide; admit that such Governing Body presently consists of 11 men, who are part of what is known as the Faithful and Discreet Slave described at Matthew 24:45-47; admit that all members of the Governing Body are spirit-anointed Christians that have a heavenly hope; admit that some of the members of the Governing Body served as members of the Board of Directors and as officers of Watchtower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania, Inc., and of Watchtower Bible and Tract Society of New York, until October, 2000; further admit that the Governing Body used Watchtower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania, to help carry out the activities of Jehovah's Witnesses worldwide; admit that the Governing Body exercises spiritual oversight over the organization of Jehovah's Witnesses worldwide and oversees the appointment of congregation elders and ministerial servants; admit that the Governing Body has six committees (Chairman's, Writing, Teaching, Publishing, Personnel and Service); and admit that the Governing Body overseers the promulgation of policies and procedures for the spiritual, physical, and emotional welfare of all persons

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 4

17

18

19

20

12

27

28

29

30

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S **COMPLAINT - 5**

associating with Jehovah's Witnesses, as well as for all of mankind in general, but deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 5 of plaintiff's complaint.

- 6. With reference to paragraph 6 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that the address for defendant Watchtower Bible and Tract Society of New York, Inc., is 25 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn, New York 11201, and the Governing Body does have ultimate spiritual authority to bar a publisher from serving in certain positions of responsibility within the organization of Jehovah's Deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 6 of plaintiff's Witnesses. complaint.
 - 7. Admit paragraph 7 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 8. With reference to paragraph 8 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that the Governing Body exercises spiritual oversight over the organization of Jehovah's Witnesses worldwide; admit that the Othello North Spanish Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses has publishers, elders, ministerial servants, pioneers and others; admit that the Governing Body oversees the appointment of congregation elders, who are those individuals who have demonstrated by their speech and conduct that they meet the spiritual requirements to serve as an elder, and further admit that elders serve as

Case 1:20-cv-00052-SPW Document 320-4 Filed 02/08/24 Page 7 of 25 Case 2:02-cv-00190-EFS ECF No. 7 filed 08/05/02 PageID.37 Page 6 of 24

spiritual shepherds and teachers for their local congregation. Defendants further admit that the elders in a local congregation are referred to as the "body of elders" and that the positions of congregation Presiding Overseer, Secretary, Service Overseer, Watchtower Study Conductor, Theocratic School Overseer and Book Study Overseer are held by elders. Further admit that elders also investigate and respond to allegations of serious sins involving a congregation publisher in accordance with the Holy Scriptures and the procedures and policies established by the Governing Body of Jehovah's Witnesses. Further admit that ministerial servants are recommended by the body of elders and appointed under the oversight of the Governing Body to render a variety of practical services within the congregation, and further allege that those individuals who are appointed as ministerial servants are men who have demonstrated by their speech and conduct that they reasonably meet the spiritual qualifications for such a position. Allegations of child molestation made against congregation publishers are investigated by congregation elders. Defendants admit that publishers who are appointed as ministerial servants are individuals who have given evidence through their speech and conduct that they reasonably meet the spiritual qualifications for such a position; admit that

28

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 6

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

a regular pioneer is a publisher who has demonstrated exemplary speech and conduct, and whose personal circumstances allow the spending of 840 hours per year in publicly preaching the good news of God's Kingdom. Defendants deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 8 of plaintiff's complaint.

With reference to paragraph 9 of plaintiff's complaint, defendants 9. admit that congregations of Jehovah's Witnesses are organized into circuits which are composed of a number of congregations, and further allege that a qualified elder serves as a circuit overseer to visit and provide spiritual encouragement to each congregation in the circuit. Defendants admit that substitute circuit overseers under the oversight of a Governing Body exist to visit congregations if the circuit overseer is unavailable to do so; admit that several circuits are organized into a district and that some of the congregations within the district are visited by a district overseer who is appointed by the Governing Body to provide spiritual encouragement to the congregations in the district of assignment; admit that periodically arrangements are made by the Governing Body to have qualified elders serve as zone overseers to visit one or more of the branch offices of Jehovah's Witnesses worldwide; admit that in each of the branch offices of Jehovah's Witnesses around the world,

28

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 7

there is a branch committee that provides spiritual oversight over the activities in the country or countries under their jurisdiction, and allege that Jehovah's Witnesses assigned as volunteers at branch offices are commonly referred to as "Bethelites," or members of the "Bethel" family; admit that there are three Bethel complexes in the United States located in Brooklyn, Patterson and Wallkill, New York; admit that the Executive Offices, Treasurer's Office, the majority of the Writing Department, and the Governing Body of Jehovah's Witnesses are located in Brooklyn, New York; admit that the United States branch Service Department and most of the Legal Department are located in Patterson, New York; admit that among the duties of the Service Department are the spiritual oversight of the congregations, elders, circuit and district overseers, and the preaching activity of Jehovah's Witnesses in the United States: further admit that from time to time the Service Department issues letters that provide spiritual assistance and guidance to congregations elders, circuit and district overseers, and to congregations, but deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 9 of plaintiff's complaint.

10. With reference to paragraph 10 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that the Governing Body of Jehovah's Witnesses provides spiritual oversight

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 8

PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN, BROOKE & MILLER LLP 117 WEST SPRAGUE AVENUE, SUITE 1200 SPOKANE, WA 99201 PHONE: (509) 455-6000

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

over the activities of Jehovah's Witnesses worldwide and further admit that the Governing Body oversees the appointment of spiritually qualified men to provide spiritual oversight over branches, districts, circuits and congregations of Jehovah's Witnesses throughout the earth, but deny the remaining allegations of paragraph 10 of plaintiff's complaint.

- 11. With reference to paragraph 11 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that Jehovah's Witnesses teach that congregation elders, as well as members of the Governing Body, are appointed by Holy Spirit to their office of spiritual oversight; admit that Jehovah's Witnesses believe that wisdom and understanding can be acquired from reading and studying the Bible; admit that congregation elders serve as spiritual teachers for all persons associated with their congregation, but deny the remaining allegations of paragraph 11 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 12. With reference to paragraph 12 of plaintiff's complaint, allege that individual Jehovah's Witnesses exercise free choice as to whether or not they want to follow direction, guidance and policies promulgated by the organization, and further allege that many choose not to follow such direction. Further allege that no one is capable of, or expected to follow such to

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 9

perfection, and deny the specific allegations in paragraph 12 of plaintiff's

defendants allege that there is much more to an individual Jehovah's Witness

becoming a publisher than the ritual of baptism. Baptism is merely the final

donations because they are directed by the Governing Body or the local

congregation. Defendants further allege that a publisher's choice to do so is

on a voluntary basis based upon their own free will. Further allege that there

is no record kept of what individual publishers do in this regard, and that some

undoubtedly are incapable of donating and/or do not collect donations.

Defendants deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 13 of plaintiff's

With reference to paragraph 14 of plaintiff's complaint, allege

Further allege that publishers do not donate personally or collect

With reference to paragraph 13 of plaintiff's complaint,

1

complaint.

13.

5 6

7

8

10

11 12

14 15

13

16 17

18

19

20

complaint.

14.

21 22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29 30

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 10

that some adult male publishers will never be eligible to be elders. Further allege that the recommendation for someone to be an elder is made by the entire local body of elders, and not by the Service Committee of the local congregation; allege that the recommendation is sent to the United States

branch where it is then reviewed by appointed elders in the Service

Department. Further, defendants allege that publishers are not told that all elders are exemplary, and allege that publishers know that elders are imperfect humans who make mistakes, and further that some of them fall away from the faith and are far from exemplary. Further allege that when it becomes known that an elder is no longer conducting himself in an exemplary fashion, he is removed. Defendants deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 14 of plaintiff's complaint.

- 15. With reference to paragraph 15 of plaintiff's complaint, defendants allege that publishers are encouraged, but not expected, to teach Bible truths to others, to include the good news of God's Kingdom, and deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 15 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 16. With reference to paragraph 16 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that at various times in the past Manuel Beliz was associated with the Othello North Spanish Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses and that he was a resident of the state of Washington during this association. Defendants further admit that subsequently, upon information and belief, Manuel Beliz was convicted of felony crimes involving sexual abuse of a minor and remains

28 DEFEN

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 11

	}			
	Case 2:02-cv-00190-EFS ECF No. 7 filed 08/05/02 PageID.43 Page 12 of 24			
1	incarcerated in the state of Washington. Further allege that Manuel Beliz was			
2	disfellowshipped for a period of time, during which time Mr. Beliz would not			
4	have been one of Jehovah's Witnesses. Defendants deny the remaining			
5	allegations of paragraph 16 of plaintiff's complaint.			
6 7				
8	III.			
9	VENUE			
10	17. Admit that venue is proper in this Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C.			
11 12	§ 1391, but deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 17 of plaintiff's			
13	complaint.			
14				
15	IV.			
16 17	OPERATIVE FACTS			
18	18. With reference to paragraph 18 of plaintiff's complaint, admit			
19	that John White is an elder in the Othello North Spanish Congregation of			
20				
21 22	Jehovah's Witnesses, and further admit that congregation elders administer			
22 23	spiritual counsel and discipline as needed to publishers associated with their			
24	local congregation, but deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 18 of			
25	plaintiff's complaint.			
26	plantin s complant.			
27				
28	PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN, BROOKE & MILLER LLI DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and 717 WEST SPRAGUE AVENUE SUITE 1200			
29 30	OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 12 717 WEST SPRAGUE AVENUE, SUITE 1200 SPOKANE, WA 99201 PHONE: (509) 455-6000			
1				

Case 1:20-cv-00052-SPW Document 320-4 Filed 02/06/24 Page 13 of 25

- 19. Deny paragraph 19 of plaintiff's complaint for lack of present information upon which to form a basis for belief.
- 20. Deny paragraph 20 of plaintiff's complaint for lack of present information upon which to form a basis for belief.
- 21. With reference to paragraph 21 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that, upon information and belief, plaintiff and her family moved to Sacramento, California, and for a period of time were members of the Las Palmas Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses at that location, but deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 21 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 22. With reference to paragraph 22 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that in June, 1996, plaintiff reported to Las Palmas Congregation elders Carlos Chicas and Milton Melendez that she had been sexually abused by Manuel Beliz, and deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 22 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 23. With reference to paragraph 23 of plaintiff's complaint, defendants admit that subsequent to receipt of the information referenced in paragraph 22 of plaintiff's complaint, elder Carlos Chicas contacted elder John White of the Othello North Spanish Congregation, and advised John White

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 13

that plaintiff had made allegations that Manuel Beliz had sexually abused her.

Defendants deny the remaining allegations of paragraph 23 of plaintiff's complaint.

- 24. With reference to paragraph 24 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that Manuel Beliz was disfellowshipped in 1996 and reinstated in 1998; admit that plaintiff provided information to police authorities in Sacramento, California, and Othello, Washington, which led to the subsequent arrest and conviction of Manuel Beliz, but deny the remaining allegations of paragraph 24 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 25. With reference to paragraph 25 of plaintiff's complaint, admit that Manuel Beliz was convicted of felony criminal sexual conduct with a minor in the Adams County Superior Court in Ritzville, Washington, and further admit that John White provided testimony to the court at the time of sentencing of Mr. Beliz, but deny the remaining allegations of paragraph 25 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 26. With respect to paragraph 26 of plaintiff's complaint, defendants deny that Washington had an applicable statute mandating any report by church ministers, to include elders of the Othello North Spanish Congregation

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 14

specifically deny any lawful duty to do so under circumstance of the information related by plaintiff to church elders in Sacramento and/or as subsequently related to elder John White of the Othello North Spanish Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses. Further allege that the applicable Washington statute (RCW 26.44.030) imposes no such requirement or duty as a matter of law. Defendants allege that the decision on reporting plaintiff's allegations to law enforcement authority was left to the sole discretion of plaintiff and/or her parents, and defendants deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 26 of plaintiff's complaint.

- 27. With reference to paragraph 27 of plaintiff's complaint, defendants admit that Manuel Beliz was subsequently convicted on felony charges based upon the information provided by the plaintiff to law enforcement authorities, but deny the remaining allegations of paragraph 27 for lack of present information upon which to form a basis for belief.
- 28. Deny paragraph 28 of plaintiff's complaint for lack of present information upon which to form a basis for belief.

27

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

28

29

30

- 29. With reference to paragraph 29 of plaintiff's complaint, these defendants reallege their response to paragraph 26 of plaintiff's complaint, as if more fully set forth herein; admit that John White is an elder with the Othello North Spanish Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, and that Carlos Chicas is an elder of the Las Palmas Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses in Sacramento, but deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 29 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 30. Deny paragraph 30 of plaintiff's complaint, and specifically allege that defendants did not learn of any allegations of sexual abuse by Manuel Beliz until after plaintiff first related such information in June, 1996, to elders of the Las Palmas Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses in Sacramento, California.
 - 31. Deny paragraph 31 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 32. With respect to paragraph 32 of plaintiff's complaint, defendants allege upon information and belief that elders John White and Carlos Chicas acted appropriately upon receiving information from plaintiff, but deny all of the remaining allegations of paragraph 32 of plaintiff's complaint.
 - 33. Deny paragraph 33 of plaintiff's complaint.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2526

27

21

28

29

30

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 17

SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION:

VI.

BREACH OF FIDUCIARY DUTY

- 41. Defendants reallege their answer to all paragraphs of this complaint as necessary to respond to paragraph 41 of plaintiff's complaint.
 - 42. Deny paragraph 42 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 43. With reference to paragraph 43 of plaintiff's complaint, defendants allege first knowledge of plaintiff's claims of sexual abuse by Manuel Beliz when such information was first provided in June, 1996; deny that any fiduciary duty was owed to plaintiff under the circumstances herein; deny that any duty was breached under the circumstances herein; and further deny any remaining allegations of paragraph 43 of plaintiff's complaint.
- 44. Deny paragraph 44 of plaintiff's complaint for lack of present information upon which to form a basis for belief, and specifically deny that plaintiff was unable to discover any injury caused by the alleged abusive acts of Manuel Beliz as of the date of the first disclosure to these defendants in June, 1996.
 - 45. Deny paragraph 45 of plaintiff's complaint.

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 18

PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN, BROOKE & MILLER LLP 717 WEST SPRAGUE AVENUE, SUITE 1200 SPOKANE, WA 99201 PHONE: (509) 455-6000

1 2

Case 1:20-cv-00052-SPW Document 320-4 Filed 02/06/24 Page 20 of 25					
Case 2:02-cv-00190-EFS ECF No. 7 filed 08/05/02 PageID.50 Page 19 of 24					
46. Deny paragraph 46 of plaintiff's complaint.					
47. Deny paragraph 47 of plaintiff's complaint.					
48. Deny paragraph 48 of plaintiff's complaint.					
VII.					
THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION:					
CHILDHOOD SEXUAL ABUSE					
49. Defendants reallege their answer to plaintiff's complaint as					
necessary to respond to paragraph 49 of plaintiff's complaint.					
50. Deny paragraph 50 of plaintiff's complaint for lack of present					
information upon which to form a basis for belief.					
51. Deny paragraph 51 of plaintiff's complaint for lack of present					
information upon which to form a basis for belief.					
VIII.					
CAUSATION AND DAMAGES					
52. Defendants reallege their answer to plaintiff's complaint as					
necessary to respond to paragraph 52 of plaintiff's complaint.					
53. Deny paragraph 53 of plaintiff's complaint.					
54. Deny paragraph 54 of plaintiff's complaint.					

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 19

55. Deny paragraph 55 of plaintiff's complaint.

IX.

JURY DEMAND

56. These defendants join plaintiff in a request for jury trial.

FOR FURTHER ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT AND AS AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES THERETO, defendants allege as follows:

- 1. Plaintiff's complaint fails to set forth a cause of action for which relief can be granted as against these answering defendants.
- 2. Plaintiff's service of process on defendant Watchtower was insufficient. Process server Angelo Rivera, of Avenger Process Services, Inc., stated in an Affidavit of Service that he left a copy of the plaintiff's complaint with Watchtower employee Ms. Donna Bush; however, Watchtower does not now and has not ever employed anyone by the name of Donna Bush.
- 3. The plaintiff's complaint is barred by operation of RCW 4.16.340.
- 4. These answering defendants owed no legal duty, and no fiduciary duty, to plaintiff under the circumstances herein such that her claims fail to

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 20

PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN, BROOKE & MILLER LLP 717 WEST SPRAGUE AVENUE, SUITE 1200 SPOKANE, WA 99201 PHONE: (509) 455-6000

state a cause of action for which relief can be granted as against these

Plaintiff's injuries and damages, if any, were due to the actions of

answering defendants.

answering defendants have no lawful liability.

5.

6. Plaintiff's injuries and damages, if any, were caused by the intervening, superseding actions or omissions of third-parties for whom these

Manuel Beliz, for whom these answering defendants have no lawful liability.

- 7. Plaintiff's injuries and damages, if any, resulted from her own fault, carelessness and negligence, and were not caused by the negligence of these answering defendants. If not the sole and proximate cause of plaintiff's injuries and damages, plaintiff's fault, carelessness and negligence was a contributing cause such that the amount of any damages must be reduced by the percentage of fault, carelessness or negligence as found to exist at the time of trial herein,
 - 8. Plaintiff's claims are barred by the doctrine of laches.
- 9. Plaintiff's claims against these answering defendants must be dismissed under provisions of the United States Constitution, First

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 21

Amendment, to specifically include the separation of church and state, and the freedom of religion.

- 10. Contrary to the assertions in plaintiff's complaint, RCW 26.44.030 does not require church ministers or clergy to report claims of sexual abuse of a minor, and any claims premised upon such allegation fail to state a claim for which relief can be granted herein.
 - 11. Plaintiff has failed to mitigate her damages herein.

WHEREFORE, having fully answered plaintiff's complaint, and having asserted affirmative defenses thereto, these answering defendants pray that plaintiff's claim be dismissed with prejudice, and that these defendants be awarded their costs and disbursements herein, to include reasonable attorney

19 ////

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

21 ////

22 ////

23

24 ////

25 26 ////

////

27

28
29
DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and
OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S
COMPLAINT - 22

fees, and such other and further relief as the Court may deem just and

equitable under the circumstances herein.

14 |

DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 23

DATED this ______ day of August, 2002.

PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN, BROOKE & MILLER LLP

By:

Gregory J. Arpin, WSBA #2746 Donald G. Stone, WSBA #7547 Attorneys for Defendants Watchtower and Othello North Spanish Congregation

Case 1:20-cv-00052-SPW Document 320-4 Filed 02/06/24 Page 25 of 25
Case 2:02-cv-00190-EFS ECF No. 7 filed 08/05/02 PageID.55 Page 24 of 24

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

2	-th		
3	I certify that on this		
5			
6	indicated below and addressed as foll	ows:	
7	Richard C. Eymann	U.S. MAIL	
8	EYMANN, ALLISON, FENNESSY,		
9	HUNTER & JONES, P.S.	OVERNIGHT MAIL	
10	601 West Main Avenue, Suite 801 Spokane, WA 99201	TELECOPY (FAX)	
11	Attorneys for Plaintiff		
12			
13	Timothy D. Kosnoff	U.S. MAIL	
14	Attorney at Law	HAND-DELIVERED OVERNIGHT MAIL	
15	Bellevue Place Building 800 Bellevue Way N.E., Suite 300	TELECOPY (FAX)	
16	Bellevue, WA 98004-4229		
17	Attorneys for Plaintiff		
18	L.C. D. A. J.	I C MAII	
19	Jeffrey R. Anderson Jodean A. Thronson	U.S. MAIL HAND-DELIVERED	
20	REINHARDT & ANDERSON	OVERNIGHT MAIL	
21	E-1000 First National Bank Bldg.	TELECOPY (FAX)	
22	332 Minnesota Street		
23	St. Paul, MN 55101		
24	Attorneys for Plaintiff	$\epsilon \rightarrow 0$	
25		Small M Xlan	
26		GREGORY J. ARPIN	
27	000 54 314.DOC:bkm	DONALD G. STONE	
28	UUUJ4514.DUUJUKIII		
29	DEFENDANTS WATCHTOWER and	PAINE, HAMBLEN, COFFIN, BROOKE & MILLER LLP 117 WEST SPRAGUE AVENUE, SUITE 1200	
30	OTHELLO'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - 24	SPOKANE, WA 99201 PHONE: (509) 455-60 0 0	